

APPROVED MINUTES OF THE STATE OF IDAHO PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS  
COMMISSION MEETING OF JANUARY 7-8, 2016

**ATTENDANCE**

Members present at January 7 committee meetings: Chipman, Enger, Hedeem, Henry, Johnson, Koehler, McKinney, Meyer, Mikolajczyk, Nelson, Nuckols, Roark, Saffle, Sulfridge, Van Mullem, Welton, Zeydel. SDE staff present: Colón, Haas, Lackey, Markland, Miranda, Schwab. Absent: Allred. Guests: Brian Church, Terry Gilbert, Alison Henken, Johanna Jones, Cristianne Lane, Matt McCarter, Meleah McCulley, Diann Roberts, Patty Sanchez, Whitney Ward.

Members present at the January 8 general meeting: Chipman, Enger, Hedeem, Henry, Johnson, Koehler, McKinney, Mikolajczyk, Nelson, Nuckols, Roark, Saffle, Sulfridge, Van Mullem, Welton, Zeydel. SDE staff present: Colón, Haas, Lackey, Markland, Miranda, Schwab. Absent: Allred, Meyer. Guests: Shauna Andrus, Brian Church, Terry Gilbert, Alison Henken.

Kim Zeydel (secondary classroom teacher – West Ada School District #2) was introduced as a new Commission member.

**AGENDA REVIEW/REVISIONS/APPROVAL**

Chair Esther Henry reported that CONSIDERATION OF STIPULATIONS/FINAL ORDERS BY FULL COMMISSION would be added to the January 8 agenda from 8:30–9:30.

**M/S (McKinney/Welton): To approve the January 7-8, 2016, Commission meeting agenda as revised.** Motion carried unanimously.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**M/S (McKinney/Enger): To approve the October 8-9, 2015, Commission meeting minutes as printed.** Motion carried unanimously.

**STATE BOARD REPORT**

Alison Henken, K-12 Accountability and Projects Program Manager in the State Board office, reported on the following board items:

1. The State Board has requested information regarding Idaho's educator pipeline. Board staff presented an initial report to the board at their December meeting and will be doing a follow-up report at the board's April meeting. The second report will include additional data and recommendations, as requested by the board. The

recommendations will be primarily focused on two things: aligning practice to the law (housekeeping) and adjusting the law (primarily Administrative Code) to align to or improve practice. The State Board would like to get feedback from the Commission regarding the proposed recommendations once they are drafted.

2. As a result of previous misinterpretation of the law, there is a disconnect between certification practices and the law. Specifically, it has been communicated to teachers that the grades they are certified to teach are based on their endorsements. The law, however, states that teachers are authorized to teach based on their certificate. Thus, there are teachers who have a certificate that limits them to a certain grade band (Example: secondary teacher certified to teach 6-12) but have an endorsement for a larger grade band (Example: that teacher has a K-12 Physical Education endorsement) who may be teaching in a grade outside of their certification (Example: that teacher is teaching elementary physical education). The board has communicated with multiple stakeholder groups about this issue and has sought feedback/ideas to correct it. Currently, the idea receiving the most traction is to add a section to rule that outlines specific requirements that an individual needs to complete to teach on their endorsement outside of their certified grade band. The deans of education have recommended that these requirements include: a pedagogy course for the other grade band, field work for the other grade band, and passage of the appropriate Praxis test. The board is seeking feedback on this idea and is also welcome to hearing other ideas/solutions.
3. The State Board has recently communicated their expectation that alternate route/non-traditional educator preparation programs be reviewed on a regular basis and has clarified that they would like this to be done by the Commission in a manner as similar as possible to what is used for the traditional educator preparation programs.
4. The State Board has recently had questions about ethics violations that are admitted in public (but without a written, signed complaint), how those violations will be dealt with by the Commission, and a possible need to change the law to provide the authority to the Commission to process the violations. Deputy Attorney General Brian Church reported that there is already guidelines language interpreting Idaho Code §33-1209 in the Commission Procedures Manual; the language allows the chief certification officer/Commission administrator to initiate an allegation if public records indicate a person holding an Idaho credential may have been involved in ethical misconduct. Brian agreed to send the guidelines language to Alison.
5. The Literacy Committee recently completed and presented to the board the Idaho Comprehensive Literacy Plan, and it has been adopted. The plan was vetted through stakeholder groups with feedback; it is specific enough to call people to action and broad enough to leave some flexibility in how people do that. The committee is now working on the distribution and implementation of the plan and

creating some measurable objectives related to that; they welcome additional feedback.

## INDIAN EDUCATION COMMITTEE

Johanna Jones, Indian Education Coordinator in the Department of Education, and Patty Sanchez, Academic Affairs Program Manager in the State Board office, presented to the Commission on the Indian Education Committee; the purpose of the presentation was discussion/feedback/engagement. Both Johanna and Patty provide staff support to the committee under the State Board. Patty gave a brief history of the committee composition. In 2013 the Department of Education and the State Board merged their Indian education efforts by forming the Indian Education Committee to address K-20 Indian education in the state; that same year the policy governing the committee was developed, and committee roles and responsibilities were identified. In October of 2015, the committee’s strategic plan, performance measures, and benchmarks were State Board-approved.

The academic gaps in Idaho that prompted the development of the committee’s strategic plan include the following (all scores obtained from spring 2013 testing):

Subject Area	All Students	American Indian Students
3 <sup>rd</sup> Grade ISAT Reading	Proficiency – 37% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – 11%	Proficiency – 47% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – <b>26%</b>
3 <sup>rd</sup> Grade ISAT Math	Proficiency – 30% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – 10%	Proficiency – 44% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – <b>28%</b>
10 <sup>th</sup> Grade ISAT Reading	Proficiency – 42% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – 11%	Proficiency – 53% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – <b>24%</b>
10 <sup>th</sup> Grade ISAT Math	Proficiency – 36% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – 24%	Proficiency – 36% Basic; Below Basic Proficiency – <b>45%</b>
Composite SAT College Readiness Scores	Grades 10, 11, and 12 – 24%	Grades 10, 11, and 12 – <b>3%</b>

Action on the part of the Indian Education Committee to close the academic gaps include: creation of the Indian education strategic plan; the inclusion of Bureau of Indian Education schools in some of the state programs such as Advanced Opportunities; State Tribal Education Partnership (STEP) grants for the Coeur d’Alene and Nez Perce Tribes; increased access to highly qualified teachers; and incorporation of the educational precept “Equity (giving everyone a shoe that fits), not equality (giving everyone a shoe).” Johanna added that culturally responsive teachers using culturally relevant pedagogy empower American Indian students to be engaged in the learning process, connect those students from their cultural knowledge to their learning content, and create and strengthen conditions for optimal learning environments for American Indian students.

Idaho is surrounded by states that have been progressive in their American Indian education efforts. Montana has Indian Education for All and their Essential Understandings Regarding Montana Indians; Washington has their Since Time Immemorial curriculum; Oregon has some American Indian Standards; and Nevada has

just adopted Montana's Essential Understandings as well. Those who want to provide feedback as the Indian Education Committee moves forward with its recommendations can contact [jjones@sde.idaho.gov](mailto:jjones@sde.idaho.gov) or [patty.sanchez@osbe.idaho.gov](mailto:patty.sanchez@osbe.idaho.gov).

## **ESTABLISHING CRITERIA FOR LOW-PERFORMING PREPARATION PROGRAMS**

Alison Henken reported that, as one of the requirements under Title II, the U.S. Department of Education has requested that Idaho, among other states, take action to 1) establish criteria for low-performing or at-risk for low-performing Idaho educator preparation programs (both traditional and alternate route); 2) create a process by which to review educator preparation programs in the state against that criteria; and 3) create a process by which to support programs that are identified as low-performing or at-risk for low-performing. Given the frequency of meetings of the involved entities and in order to accomplish this prior to July 1, Alison recommended that Lisa Colón and staff gather more information about specifically what Idaho has been tasked with; first discuss the effort in the state's Institutions of Higher Education (IHE) Coalition; then discuss the effort in the Idaho Association of Colleges for Teacher Education; forward the item to the full Commission and the Commission Standards Committee for discussion at their March 31 and April 1 meetings; and then have a final draft ready for approval consideration at the June 23 and 24 Commission meeting. In the interim, Alison, Lisa, and Commission staff will communicate with Department of Education staff to determine the appropriate method and time to get stakeholder input on the low-performing or at-risk for low-performing educator preparation program criteria and processes.

## **CONSIDERATION OF STIPULATIONS/FINAL ORDERS BY FULL COMMISSION**

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (McKinney/Nelson): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21531 regarding the certificate of Elizabeth A. Butler.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Chipman, Henry, Mikolajczyk, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church provided the Commission with the Stipulation listed below. The Stipulation was agreed to by the respective Respondent and was presented by Brian Church and recommended by the Executive Committee for adoption by the Commission. The Commission members reviewed the Stipulation at the meeting and voted as follows:

**M/S (Nelson/Enger): To accept the proposed Stipulation as written and enter the accompanying Consent Order in Case #21504 regarding the certificate of Katharine A.**

**McCloud.** Motion carried unanimously. Commission members Chipman, Henry, Mikolajczyk, Nuckols, and Roark were recused from voting.

Deputy Attorney General Brian Church presented an informal request to the Commission from the attorney for William McCarrel, Jr., an individual whom the Commission previously entered a Consent Order for in Case #21010, agreeing to a stipulation. Brian reviewed the stipulation from that case and presented the Commission with the informal request. Brian then asked for the Commission's decision, and the Commission voted to deny the request and take no further action on the request.

## **ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT**

Commission administrator Lisa Colón (unless indicated otherwise) reported on the following.

1. The IHE Coalition and Commission staff members are currently planning regional career fairs for the spring, where hiring school districts will be able to have access to graduating educator preparation program candidates. The following career fairs are tentatively scheduled: Pocatello – March 30; Nampa – April 5; Coeur d'Alene – May 11; and Moscow – May 12; and Twin Falls - TBD. Districts and candidates can attend as many career fairs as desired. There is also discussion of how to measure the success of the career fairs.
2. At the last Commission meeting, a proposed sliding scale fee for renewal certification was discussed. It has been decided to not move forward on that proposal at the current time; there are a number of years of sufficient operational funds before there is real concern.
3. Lisa called Commission member attention to the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA), which was signed in mid-December and reauthorizes the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). The ESSA also replaces the previous version of the law, the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) Act. Deb Hedeem offered to send members a progress report on elementary and secondary education in relation to ESSA and an overview of the projected ESSA implementation timeline.
4. Executive staff members in the Department of Education have been working on the development of a very specific strategic plan on how the department is going to help students. Once released, it will be shared with the full Commission.
5. Idaho, along with all other states, has developed its Equitable Access to Excellent Educators Plan, in response to the U.S. Department of Education's Excellent Educators for All initiative. The plan must ensure that poor and minority children are not taught at higher rates than other children by inexperienced, unqualified, or out-of-field teachers. Idaho must identify high-need schools that are successfully recruiting and retaining effective teachers. As a part of this, at a past Commission meeting there was discussion on the ability to collect data on the number of

applicants a district has in its teacher applicant pool. Idaho does have someone from Education Northwest looking at some data elements that may be able to help in the area of the teacher pipeline or teacher shortage, but Lisa reported that the State Department of Education does not currently have the ability to collect data on a district's teacher applicant pool, and there is also concern that such data may not be accurate.

On a similar note, Lisa reported she is still researching Teachers-Teachers.com, a service designed to help educators find new teaching jobs, administrative jobs, and other related service positions. There is also an internal committee working on the teacher shortage issue, and it will seek stakeholder input.

6. The Department of Education has issued a request for proposal (RFP) for the independent or outside review of teacher evaluations that will be conducted annually in Idaho; a reviewer contract has been awarded. The review of the evaluations will begin around the end of January. The intent is to have the data analysis for the aggregated data by the end of April.
7. Lisa reminded everyone that, as of September 1, 2015, when renewing (online and paper) or applying for certification, official transcripts must be submitted.
8. The program approval review for Boise State University (BSU) will be held March 5-8, 2016. BSU will be the first Idaho higher education institution to be reviewed under Council for the Accreditation of Educator Preparation (CAEP) standards.
9. Standards reviews that have already been completed were Mathematics on November 12-13 and Science (Biology, Chemistry, Earth/Space Science, Natural Science, Physical Science, Physics) on December 3-4. Upcoming standards reviews include the following: Elementary Education – January 21-22; Pre-Service Technology – January 28-29; and Visual/Performing Arts (Drama, Music, Visual Arts) – March 10-11.
10. Recent staff travel included the following: National Association of State Directors of Teacher Education and Certification (NASDTEC) Professional Practices Institute (PPI) – Annette, Shannon, and Brian; Council of Chief State School Officers (CCSSO)-National and State Collaboration for Educator Effectiveness (NSCEE) – Supporting Principals Action Group – Lisa; Region 4 Superintendents' Meeting – Lisa; CCSSO-Equity Plan – Cina; CCSSO-Communications – Lisa.
10. Upcoming staff travel includes the following: NASDTEC Winter Symposium – Lisa and Cina; National Association for Alternative Certification (NAAC) Annual Conference – Cina.

## AUTHORIZATIONS COMMITTEE

Chair Elisa Saffle reported that during their November 30 and December 16 teleconferences and their January 7 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve the following new Teacher to New Certificate/Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year):

ADAMS, Stephanie, Xavier Charter School #462, Mathematics 6/12  
ALEXANDER, Matthew, Jerome Joint #261, Counselor K/12  
ALLISON, Kathleen, iSucceed Virtual High School #466, School Principal Pre-K/12  
AMES, Karen, Cassia County Joint #151, Generalist K/12  
BARWICK, Alan, Madison #321, Health K/12  
BOURNER, Tim, New Plymouth #372, Health 6/12  
BOWIE, Amy, Pocatello #25, School Principal Pre-K/12  
COOK, LaWrell, West Side Joint #202, Health 6/12  
COOK, Ryan, Idaho Falls #91, Health K/12  
CORIELL, Marria, Glens Ferry Joint #192, Physical Science 6/12  
DANIELS, Jill, Oneida County #351, Generalist K/12  
DE LA PAZ, Adan, Another Choice Virtual Charter #476, Generalist K/12  
DESHNER, Brittany, Plummer-Worley Joint #44, Spanish 6/12  
DICKERSON, Diana, Jefferson County Joint #251, Generalist K/12  
DISCIASCIO, Ciadie, Challis Joint #181, Art K/12  
DODGE, Mark, Grace Joint #148, Counselor K/12  
DURHAM, Daniel, Mountain Home #193, Generalist K/12  
EVANS, Carrie, Ririe Joint #252, All Subjects K/8  
FRITZ, Laura, Mullan #392, Family and Consumer Sciences 6/12  
FUGATE, Chelsie, Culdesac Joint #342, Biological Science 6/12  
GILLETTE-SHIPPEN, Kaly, Jerome Joint #261, School Principal Pre-K/12  
GURNEY, Marvin, Gooding Joint #231, Physical Science 6/12; Biological Science 6/12  
HANAN, Adam, Kootenai Technical Education Campus #641, Sports Medicine/Athletic Trainer  
HARDCASTLE, Benjamin, Dietrich #314, Superintendent  
HARTVIGSEN, Jenny, Caldwell #132, English 6/9  
HELGESON, Russell, Coeur d'Alene #271, Generalist K/12  
HOBBS, Alexandra, Liberty Charter #458, English 6/9; Mathematics 6/9  
HUGGINS, Katie, Boundary County #101, All Subjects K/8  
HUSTED, Elizabeth, Nezperce Joint #302, Art K/12  
HUTCHESON, Kayla, Kimberly #414, All Subjects K/8  
JENSEN, Krishele, Oneida County #351, Generalist K/12  
JOHNSON, David L., North Idaho STEM Charter Academy District #480, Economics 6/12  
KANTOLA, Jeffrey, Coeur d'Alene #271, Physical Science 6/12  
KELTZ, Thomas Josh, Kellogg Joint #391, Mathematics 6/12  
LELIEFELD, Kandace, Kellogg Joint #391, Mathematics 6/12  
LLOYD, Kimberly, North Gem #149, Birth/3  
MAGANA, Kaitlin, Jefferson County Joint #251, Generalist K/12

MAHAVONG, Christopher, Jerome Joint #261, Health 6/12  
 MANHART, Carly, Caldwell #132, Business Technology Education 6/12  
 MANSHIP, Ken, Vallivue #139, Business Technology Education 6/12  
 MARTINEZ, Sabrina, Lewiston #340, Gifted and Talented K/12  
 MONTESANO, Sara, Teton County #401, Natural Science 6/12  
 O'BRIEN, Venice, Jerome Joint #261, Early Childhood Special Education Pre-K/3  
 PFLUEGER, Gary, Boundary County #101, Superintendent  
 POST, Tyrell, Jefferson County Joint #251, Health 6/12  
 POWELL, Brian, Lake Pend Oreille #84, Economics 6/12  
 RADIGAN, Rhonda, West Ada #2, Generalist K/12  
 REMBELSKI, Lani, Challis Joint #181, School Principal Pre-K/12  
 RINGLE, David, Cassia County Joint #151, Mathematics-Basic 6/12  
 RODRIQUEZ, Kayla, Idaho Falls #91, Generalist K/12  
 ROJAS, Rachel, Another Choice Virtual Charter #476, English 6/12  
 ROSE, Shawn, American Heritage Charter District #482, School Principal Pre-K/12  
 SANTA MARIA, Joseph, INSPIRE Virtual Charter Academy #457, Health K/12  
 SEMKO, Elayne, Wallace #393, Family and Consumer Sciences 6/12  
 SHOEMAKER, Chase, New Plymouth #372, Biological Science 6/12  
 SMITH, Julee, Jerome Joint #261, Physical Education K/12; Health K/12  
 STEWART, J. Michelle, Clark County #161, Music K/12  
 SUAREZ, Renae, Bonneville Joint #93, Sociology 6/12  
 SUTTON, Pamela, Canyon-Owyhee School Service Agency #555, Birth/3  
 SWAYZE, Audrey, Buhl Joint #412, Counselor K/12  
 TRELLES, Anna, Jerome Joint #261, Spanish K/12  
 WAITS, Aaron, Genesee Joint #282, Spanish 6/12  
 WARNER, Tyler, Boundary County #101, Geography 6/12  
 WHEATLEY, Rachel, Boundary County #101, Biological Science 6/12; Mathematics-Basic 6/12  
 WILSON, Gretchen, Lewiston #340, Gifted and Talented K/12  
 WOLCOTT, Robert, Plummer-Worley Joint #44, Physical Science 6/12; Biological Science 6/12  
 WOODWORTH, Brian, Rockland #382, Natural Science 6/12  
 ZACCARDI, Tanya, Syringa Mountain School #488, All Subjects K/8

During their November 30 and December 16 teleconferences and their January 7 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve the following renewal Teacher to New Certificate/Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year):

ANDERSON, Eric, Hagerman Joint #233, Superintendent (2)  
 BUNDY, Nathan, Mountain Home #193, Mathematics 6/12 (2)  
 DUNN, Anne, Cambridge Joint #432, Early Childhood Special Education Pre-K/3 (2)  
 EDEN, Cynthia, Canyon-Owyhee School Service Agency #555, Gifted and Talented K/12 (2)  
 ELLSWORTH, Jacob, Palouse Prairie Charter #472, School Principal Pre-K/12 (3)  
 FISHER, Cody, Glens Ferry Joint #192, Superintendent (2)

GORE, Shadrack, West Jefferson #253, Generalist K/12 (2)  
GREEN, Chantelle, Sugar-Salem Joint #322, Teacher Librarian K/12 (2)  
HANSEN, Lance, Lewiston #340, Superintendent (3)  
HAUGHT, Michelle, Kimberly #414, Director of Special Education (2)  
KENNEDY, Bryon, Sugar-Salem Joint #322, Director of Special Education (3)  
LITTLE, Tim, Marsing Joint #363, School Principal Pre-K/12 (3)  
LOGAN, Aprill, Forrest M. Bird Charter District #487, Physics 6/12; Chemistry 6/12 (3)  
MCCONNELL, Lisa, Jefferson County Joint #251, Health 6/12 (2)  
REED, Jared, Aberdeen #58, Physical Education 6/12 (3)  
SCHULZ, Maureen, Lewiston #340, Birth/3 (3)  
SCOTT, Melissa, Mountain Home #193, Generalist K/12 (2)  
STEIMER, Harry, Canyon-Owyhee School Service Agency #555, Generalist K/12 (2)  
VANDERGRUFF, Deann, Post Falls #273, Generalist K/12 (2)  
WADSWORTH, Angel, Jefferson County Joint #251, Generalist K/12 (2)  
WADSWORTH, Darryl, Grace Joint #148, Agricultural Science and Technology 6/12 (2)  
WAGONER, Kathleen, Clark County #161, Mathematics 6/12 (2)  
WEAVER, Alicia, Twin Falls #411, English 6/12 (2)  
WILLFORD, Sterling, Sugar-Salem Joint #322, Gifted and Talented K/12 (2)  
WILLIAMS, Corey, Lewiston #340, School Principal Pre-K/12 (2)  
WILSON, Robin, Emmett #221, Mathematics-Basic 6/12 (2)  
YOUNG, Gayle, Melba Joint #136, Generalist K/12 (2)

During their November 30 and December 16 teleconferences and their January 7 meeting, the Authorizations Committee recommended that the Commission approve 197 Alternative Authorization - Content Specialist Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year) and 3 Alternative Authorization – Pupil Personnel Services Endorsement requests (for the 2015-2016 school year).

Elisa also distributed a break out of 2014-2015 total authorizations by region to Commission members. Regions with larger districts (Regions 3, 4, and 6) have more authorizations. In the area of ABCTE authorizations, those numbers are: Region 3 – 21; Region 6 – 9; Region 4 – 7; and charter schools – 8. In actuality, there is only a small percentage of Idaho educators teaching on an authorization or an ABCTE 3-year, interim certificate; it varies from 1.4 percent to 3.4 percent.

The committee also worked on developing Authorizations Committee procedures for district-appealed alternative authorizations that have been previously denied by the committee. The document is now in draft form; Commission member feedback is requested.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Authorizations Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE**

Chair Ginny Welton reported that the committee has a recommendation for the professional development of educators in the state. It would involve Professional Development Committee members choosing several different types of the typical ethics cases that the Commission sees and then creating a short synopsis to explain the scenario in each case, why it was a violation, and why it was in opposition to a specific principle in the Code of Ethics for Idaho Professional Educators. No names or specific details of actual cases would be provided, and, in some instances, cases would be created. These case situations would then be included under the “Training” tab of the Commission website to create a link entitled Examples of Ethical Violations for use by those who are applying for, reinstating, or revising their certification.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Professional Development Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **BUDGET SUBCOMMITTEE**

In Chair Laural Nelson’s absence, staff member Annette Schwab reported that for the month of September, revenue was \$46,090; expenditures were \$43,083, with revenue exceeding expenditures by \$3,007. In addition to routine operational costs, there were the following expenses: \$250 – October Commission meeting; \$1,100 – contracted investigator services; \$4,500 – ISU program review; \$250 – Idaho Education Laws and Rules books for staff; \$5,000 – computer replacement for 5 staff members. For October, revenue was \$24,720; expenditures were \$44,364, with expenditures exceeding revenue by \$19,644. Expenses not part of routine operational costs during the month included the following: \$5,500 – October Commission meeting; \$2,000 – staff airfare to attend the Professional Practices Institute (PPI); \$150 – supplies for upcoming standards reviews; \$2,500 – remainder of cost for ISU program review. For November, revenue was \$16,150; expenditures were \$40,174, with expenditures exceeding revenue by \$24,024. Expenses not part of routine operational costs during the month included the following: \$100 – remainder of cost for October Commission meeting; \$1,500 – contracted investigator services; \$450 – remainder of cost for staff to attend PPI; \$150 – supplies for upcoming standards reviews; \$3,000 – standards reviews for math and science; \$300 – Lisa’s travel to a CCSSO meeting and a superintendents’ meeting in Twin Falls (a portion of the \$300 will be reimbursed). The accounting reports for all three months were reconciled and balanced.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Budget Subcommittee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **STANDARDS COMMITTEE**

Chair Heather Van Mullem reported on the following committee discussion items (unless indicated otherwise):

1. Idaho teacher preparation program representatives will be invited to participate in an Educational Testing Service (ETS) Data Manager Tool training. This Data Manager Tool allows for analysis of the types of questions missed on Praxis exams that teacher preparation program candidates must take. In this way, it is hoped that teacher preparation program representatives can better prepare their candidates.
2. At the March Commission meeting, the Standards Committee will review the report from the Idaho State University program approval review.
3. The Idaho Higher Education (IHE) Coalition, in conjunction with the Idaho Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (IACTE), is currently developing a list of best practices for the clinical supervision of pre-service interns. When it is completed, the coalition will share their recommendations with the committee for consideration as requirements for institutional recommendations.
4. Standards Committee members, along with Commission staff, are working on draft revisions of the Commission working plan and the Commission Procedures Manual that apply to their specific committee. These revisions will be reviewed during the March Commission meeting.
5. The Idaho Higher Education Literacy Partnership (IHELP) group visited the committee regarding the group's review of the Literacy Standards for Educator Preparation. IHELP's recommendations are to 1) revise language in Administrative Code related to literacy requirements for educator pre-service preparation and certification renewal; 2) update the Literacy Standards for Educator Preparation and increase from three to four standards to better align with Idaho Core Standards; and 3) revise and update the Idaho Comprehensive Literacy Assessment and align the implementation of it at the state's higher education institutions. The IHELP group, working in conjunction with the Idaho Literacy Committee, also has specific recommendations for standards for pre-service preparation and interim out-of-state, interim alternative route, teacher renewal, and administrator renewal certification. The Standards Committee emphasized the need for flexibility and caution in how prescriptive we are in defining how learning outcomes are to be met. Kristi Enger will attend the next IHELP meeting to explore how Professional-Technical Education (PTE) can be integrated into the discussion.
6. The State Board's Indian Education Committee visited the Standards Committee and distributed a draft of the Idaho Indian Education 2016-2021 strategic plan and recommendation to incorporate culturally relevant pedagogy (specific to American Indian history and culture) into Idaho Core Teaching Standards. In the coming months, the Indian Education Committee will meet with Montana, Oregon, Washington, and Alaska to explore and understand how those states have chosen to imbed culturally responsive pedagogical strategies into their standards for educator preparation. After those meetings occur, the Indian Education

Committee will draft related suggestions for the review team of our Core Teaching Standards in 2016-2017.

7. The program review manual revision is close to completion. Committee members spent a considerable amount of time discussing the proposed revisions.
  - The state-specific requirements will be included in the manual. The University of Idaho and Lewis-Clark State College will be piloting these requirements as part of their mid-cycle review during 2016-2017.
  - Currently the Commission pays the expenses for state reviews of higher education institutions. In March, the exploration of the history and rationale for this practice will be added to the committee's meeting agenda; the committee will also discuss the state review process of a higher education institution not pursuing national accreditation.
  - Consideration will be given to including a checklist specific to program review components/expectations in the manual timeline to help institutions of higher education in their preparation.
  - It is recommended to adjust language in the manual regarding conditionally approved programs by 1) differentiating why a program received a "Conditional Approval" (low number of completers or insufficient evidence); 2) adding language clarifying how a conditionally approved program could move to either becoming approved, not approved, or remaining conditionally approved; and 3) adding language clarifying how a higher education institution can take corrective action to address areas for improvement if the program is not recommended for approval.
  - Final consideration of proposed revisions to the program review manual will occur at the March Standards Committee meeting.
8. The 2014-2022 schedule for the teacher preparation standards reviews has been updated with the new endorsements (e.g., computer science, engineering, and consulting teacher) and will be posted to the Commission website.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Standards Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Chair Esther Henry reported that the Executive Committee met with Deputy Attorney General Brian Church, Shannon Haas, and Annette Schwab to discuss ethics case information.

Brian presented proposed language revision for question 8 (Licensing and Legal History) on the certification application for committee review; the revision is intended to clarify how the applicant should answer on the form if he/she has been involved in any past legal action. Certification staff will implement a new set of questions on the certification application that will hopefully reduce any confusion about what the applicant needs to

report. Additionally, Brian provided the committee with a Probable Cause Determination Form or check list that would provide clarity to committee members in identifying specifically what statute or code of ethics principle has been violated in ethics cases.

**M/S (Koehler/Chipman): To move the Executive Committee into Executive Session to review and discuss investigation records exempt from disclosure as prescribed by Idaho Code §67-2345(d).** Motion carried unanimously.

Brian reviewed the cases needing Executive Committee decisions.

**M/S (Chipman/Koehler): To move the Executive Session of the Executive Committee into Open Session to vote on investigation records exempt from disclosure as prescribed by Idaho Code §67-2345(d).** Motion carried unanimously.

Esther Henry reported that actions taken by the Executive Committee included: 14 letters of reprimand; 3 revocations; and 2 suspensions. There are currently 2 cases on hold; 3 cases awaiting stipulation; 2 cases in which the administrative complaint has been filed; and 31 cases with deputy attorney general pending action.

Commission members spoke briefly about the possible need to amend Idaho Code §33-1209(4) to allow an ethics hearing panel to assess attorney fees, investigator costs, and costs associated with the hearing to be paid by the respondent, per the hearing panel's discretion. Brian Church said that it is his understanding that the State Board has sent forward legislation that would encompass attorney fees; he is not sure of the status of that legislation.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Executive Committee.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **LEADERSHIP TEAM**

Chair Esther Henry reported that the Leadership Team met by teleconference on December 16. At that time, Lisa Colón gave the team a brief summary of her administrative report for the upcoming January Commission meeting. The team also reviewed the January full Commission meeting agenda and the budget. The next Leadership Team teleconference will be held on March 16.

**The Commission ACCEPTED the report of the Leadership Team.** Motion carried unanimously.

## **OLD BUSINESS**

### **Professional Practices Institute**

Shannon Haas, Brian Church, and Annette Schwab attended the NASDTEC Professional Practices Institute (PPI) in Atlanta, Georgia, on October 13-16, 2015. Shannon reported

on the Atlanta Public Schools cheating scandal covered in a conference session by the prosecuting team that oversaw the investigation/indictment/conviction of all approximately 180 district employees involved in the cheating. The investigation began in 2009, and the report was completed in 2011. The cheating involved correcting the answers entered by students on standardized achievement tests. The employees included principals (38 of them), teachers, and testing coordinators; 44 out of 56 schools were involved. At no time did the superintendent admit to any wrongdoing; she claimed she had no idea it was going on. In 2009 she had been given the Superintendent of the Year award, and she was praised in Atlanta for raising test scores. She finally resigned in 2011 and died before going to trial. Many of the employees were convicted of racketeering charges in violation of a law that brought down a Mafia family; they reported that they participated in the cheating because they wanted the bonuses associated with rising student achievement and they wanted to improve the reputation of their superintendent.

Brian reported on two conference sessions – one in which FBI agents talked about proper investigation techniques and how the FBI works at obtaining information and another that was a hypothetical mock scenario of an ethics case with attorney’s arguments and the educator’s arguments. Brian felt that the PPI is definitely worth attending, and he appreciated learning what is occurring across the country, what other states are developing, how NASDTEC is approaching different issues, and what an Executive Committee such as ours may look for in an ethics case.

Annette reported appreciation for the opportunity to collaborate with peers from other states. She attended a conference session in which participants were divided into small groups, and within a group each individual state representative shared what his/her state’s operating policy is in different licensure areas, such as reinstatement, lying on applications, etc. Annette reported leaving the conference feeling very comfortable with Idaho’s moderate stance through its rules/statutes – neither too stringent (looking at every DUI) nor too lenient (doing nothing about inappropriate text messages).

## **NEW BUSINESS**

### **Member Terms of Service Ending 6/30/16**

Commission member terms of service (for constituency representation) ending in the near future because of term expiration include the following:

Secondary Classroom Teacher – Esther Henry has completed the partial term of her predecessor and two 3-year terms of her own; ineligible for additional term; Idaho Education Association (IEA) and Northwest Professional Educators (NWPE) will be requested to submit nominees.

Secondary School Principal – Becky Meyer has served two 3-year terms of her own; ineligible for additional term; Idaho Association of Secondary School Principals (IASSP) will be requested to submit nominees.

School Counselor – Kim Mikolajczyk has served one 3-year term of her own; ineligible for additional term, as she has moved from school counselor position to an elementary principal position; IEA and NWPE will be requested to submit nominees.

Secondary Classroom Teacher – Mikki Nuckols has served two 3-year terms of her own; ineligible for additional term; IEA and NWPE will be requested to submit nominees.

Public Higher Education (Letters and Sciences Representation) – Tony Roark has served one 3-year term of his own; IACTE has nominated him to serve another term; he wishes to serve another term.

Public Higher Education – Heather Van Mullem has served one 3-year term of her own; IACTE has nominated Taylor Raney of the University of Idaho to succeed her.

Exceptional Child Education – Virginia Welton has served one 3-year term of her own; eligible for additional term; IEA and NWPE will be requested to submit nominees; she wishes to serve another term.

## COMMUNICATION PLAN

Heather Van Mullem reported that items of interest in these meeting minutes for member communication to constituencies include the following:

- **Idaho Educator Pipeline.** State Board has requested information regarding the pipeline; initial report in December 2015 and follow-up report in April 2016 (see page 1, STATE BOARD REPORT, item 1).
- **Certification Grade Range Concern.** Disconnect between certification practices and the law; in the past teachers told grades they are certified to teach are based on their endorsements; law states teachers authorized to teach based on their certificate (see page 1, STATE BOARD REPORT, item 2).
- **Program Reviews of Non-Traditional Programs.** Alternate route/non-traditional educator preparation programs to be reviewed by Commission on regular basis (see page 1, STATE BOARD REPORT, item 3).
- **Sliding Scale Renewal Application Fee Update.** No plan to move forward (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 2).
- **Department of Education Strategic Plan.** Plan to soon be public (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 4).
- **Idaho Equitable Access to Excellent Educators Plan.** Plan approved and available for review (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 5).
- **Submission of Official Transcripts Now Mandatory.** Official transcripts must now be submitted along with certification renewal or initial applications (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 7).
- **Indian Education Committee.** Staff support for the committee shared strategic plan to include culturally responsive pedagogy into teacher preparation program standards (see page 3, INDIAN EDUCATION COMMITTEE; see page 10, STANDARDS COMMITTEE, item 6).

- **IHELP Committee.** Members presented draft recommendations for changes to Idaho Comprehensive Literacy Plan (see page 1, STATE BOARD REPORT, item 5; page 10, STANDARDS COMMITTEE, item 5).
- **Career Fairs for Educators.** Tentative dates/locations have been scheduled (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 1).
- **BSU Program Review.** Scheduled for early March (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 8).
- **Standards Reviews.** Have been completed in two content areas; upcoming reviews scheduled in three content areas (see page 5, ADMINISTRATIVE REPORT, item 9).
- **Authorizations Committee.** Break out of approved authorizations provided; appeal process for denied authorizations being developed (see page 7, AUTHORIZATIONS COMMITTEE, mid-page paragraphs on page 9).
- **Professional Development Committee.** Hypothetical scenarios of Code of Ethics violations to be included on Commission website under “Training” (see page 10, PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE).
- **Standards Committee.** IHE Coalition working on best practices for clinical supervision of pre-service interns; program approval manual undergoing revision; the state-specific standards will eventually be part of the program approval reviews; updated standards review schedule to be posted to Commission website (see page 10, STANDARDS COMMITTEE, items 3, 7, and 8).
- **Executive Committee.** Language specific to questions on the certification application about past criminal activity is being re-written to help provide clarity (see page 12, EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE, second paragraph).
- **Nominees for Commission Service.** Nominees to Commission to be solicited from IEA, NWPE, and IASSP (see page 14, NEW BUSINESS – Member Terms of Service Ending 6/30/16).

## ADJOURNMENT

**M/S (Sulfridge/McKinney): To adjourn the meeting.** Motion carried unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.

---

Mary Jane Markland, Secretary  
Professional Standards Commission

---

Lisa Colón, Administrator  
Professional Standards Commission